

# **Stimulering van geletterdheid met ouder-kindprogramma's voor kinderen in achterstandssituaties**

Een meta-analyse van effecten en  
werkzame elementen

Bijlagen

## Bijlage 1 Literatuursearches

### PsycINFO Ovid

(Literacy/ OR Literacy programs/ OR Vocabulary/ OR Writing skills/ OR (reading OR read OR reader\* OR literacy OR ((alphabet\* OR letter\* OR Phonemi\* OR Phonolog\* OR word) ADJ3 (skill\* OR recogni\* OR naming OR fluen\* OR knowledge\* OR aware\*)) OR spelling OR decoding OR ((meaning OR Code OR comprehens\*) ADJ3 skill\*) OR ((concept\* OR environment\*) ADJ3 print\*) OR writing OR written OR write OR vocabular\* OR early language).ab,ti.) AND (exp Nuclear Family/ OR Family/ OR exp Grandparents/ OR Family Relations/ OR Single-Parents/ OR exp Parent Child Relations/ OR (parent\* OR grandchild\* OR grandparent\* OR mother\* OR father\* OR maternal\* OR paternal\* OR grandmother\* OR grandfather\* OR sibling\* OR sister\* OR brother\* OR famil\* OR at home OR (home ADJ3 environment\*) OR home language OR home-base\* OR home-visit\* OR home-litera\* OR home-setting OR home-situation\* OR children of).ab,ti.) AND (exp Social Class/ OR Multilingualism/ OR Cross Cultural Differences / OR exp Immigration/ OR Educational Background/ OR exp Minority Groups/ OR Poverty/ OR Poverty Areas/ OR exp Socioeconomic Status/ OR (high risk OR at risk OR disadvantag\* OR free lunch\* OR reduc\* lunch\* OR ((low\* adj income\*) NOT (low\* income\* ADJ3 countr\*)) OR (low ADJ3 litera\*) OR illitera\* OR socioecon\* OR socio-econ\* OR ((social ) ADJ3 (class\* OR status\* OR low\* OR environment\*)) OR (low\* ADJ3 (class\* OR educat\*)) OR (working ADJ3 class\*) OR bilingual\* OR multilingual\* OR povert\* OR urban\* OR ((ethnic\* OR language\* OR linguist\*) ADJ3 (divers\* OR factor\* OR minorit\*)) OR (english ADJ3 (second language)) OR ((home OR native OR first) ADJ (language) ADJ3 "not English") OR migrant\* OR immigrant\* OR refugee\* OR (education\* ADJ (status OR level)) OR native OR depriv\* OR ((mother\* OR father\* OR parent\* OR maternal\* OR paternal\*) ADJ education\*) OR single-parent\* OR Socio-demograph\*).ab,ti.) AND ((experiment\* OR quasiexperiment\* OR intervention\* OR program\* OR efficac\* OR ((effect\* OR impact\*) ADJ3 stud\*) OR effectivit\* OR effective\* OR effects OR evaluat\* OR trial\* OR random\*).ab,ti.) AND (100.ag. OR (infan\* OR child\* OR kid OR kids OR toddler\* OR boy\* OR girl\* OR kindergar\* OR prepubescen\* OR prepubert\* OR schoolchild\* OR preschool\*).ab,ti.) NOT (exp \* dyslexia/ OR (disabilit\* OR dyslex\*).ti.) NOT (health literacy/ OR ((health OR ehealth OR emotion\* OR media OR nutrition\* OR food OR information\*) ADJ literac\*).ab,ti.) AND english.la.

### Web of Science

TS=(((reading OR read OR reader\* OR literacy OR ((alphabet\* OR letter\* OR Phonemi\* OR Phonolog\* OR word) NEAR/2 (skill\* OR recogni\* OR naming OR fluen\* OR knowledge\* OR aware\*)) OR spelling OR decoding OR ((meaning OR Code OR comprehens\*) NEAR/2 skill\*) OR ((concept\* OR environment\*) NEAR/2 print\*) OR writing OR written OR write OR vocabular\* OR "early language")) AND ((parent\* OR grandchild\* OR grandparent\* OR mother\* OR father\* OR maternal\* OR paternal\* OR grandmother\* OR grandfather\* OR sibling\* OR sister\* OR brother\* OR famil\* OR "at home" OR (home NEAR/2 environment\*) OR "home language" OR home-base\* OR home-visit\* OR home-litera\* OR home-setting OR home-situation\* OR "children of")) AND (("high risk" OR "at risk" OR disadvantag\* OR "free lunch\*" OR "reduc\* lunch\*" OR ("low\* income\*" NOT ("low\* income\*" NEAR/2 countr\*)) OR (low NEAR/2 litera\*) OR illitera\* OR socioecon\* OR socio-econ\* OR ((social ) NEAR/2 (class\* OR status\* OR low\* OR environment\*)) OR (low\* NEAR/2 (class\* OR educat\*)) OR (working NEAR/2 class\*) OR bilingual\* OR

multilingual\* OR povert\* OR urban\* OR ((ethnic\* OR language\* OR linguist\*) NEAR/2 (divers\* OR factor\* OR minorit\*)) OR (english NEAR/2 ("second language")) OR ((home OR native OR first) NEAR/1 (language) NEAR/2 "not English") OR migrant\* OR immigrant\* OR refugee\* OR (education\* NEAR/1 (status OR level)) OR native OR depriv\* OR ((mother\* OR father\* OR parent\* OR maternal\* OR paternal\*) NEAR/1 education\*) OR "single-parent\*" OR Socio-demograph\*) AND ((infan\* OR child\* OR kid OR kids OR toddler\* OR boy\* OR girl\* OR kindergar\* OR prepubescen\* OR prepubert\* OR schoolchild\* OR preschool\*)) NOT (((health OR ehealth OR emotion\* OR media OR nutrition\* OR food OR information\*) NEAR/1 literac\*) OR disabilit\* OR dyslex\*) AND ((experiment\* OR quasiexperiment\* OR intervention\* OR program\* OR efficac\* OR ((effect\* OR impact\*) NEAR/2 stud\*) OR effectivit\* OR effective\* OR effects OR evaluat\* OR trial\* OR random\*)) ) AND LA=(english)

### **ERIC ProQuest**

(MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Reading") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT("Reading Achievement") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Prereading Experience") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Reading Development") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Reading Readiness") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Reading Ability") OR AB, TI(reading OR read OR reader OR readers OR literacy OR ((alphabet OR letter OR letters OR Phoneml\* OR Phonolog\* OR word) NEAR/3 (skill OR skills OR recogni\* OR naming OR fluency OR fluent OR knowledge OR aware\*)) OR spelling OR decoding OR ((meaning OR Code OR comprehens\*) NEAR/3 (skill OR skills)) OR ((concept OR concepts OR environment\*) NEAR/3 print\*) OR writing OR written OR write OR vocabulary OR vocabularies OR "early language")) AND (MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Family (Sociological Unit)") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("family life") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("family influence") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("family role") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("family environment") OR AB, TI(parent OR parents OR parental OR grandchild OR grandchildren OR grandparent OR grandparents OR mother OR father OR mothers OR fathers OR maternal\* OR paternal\* OR grandmother OR grandfather OR sibling OR sister OR brother OR family OR grandmothers OR grandfathers OR siblings OR sisters OR brothers OR families OR "at home" OR (home NEAR/3 environment\*) OR "home language" OR home-based OR home-visit OR home-visits OR home-litera\* OR home-setting OR home-situation OR "children of")) AND (MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Ethnicity ") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Immigrants ") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Socioeconomic Background") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Socioeconomic Status") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Socioeconomic Influences") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Social Class") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Social Differences") OR AB, TI("high risk" OR "at risk" OR disadvantag\* OR "free lunch\*" OR "reduc\* lunch\*" OR (low NEAR/3 litera\*) OR illitera\* OR socioecon\* OR socio-econ\* OR ((social ) NEAR/3 (class\* OR status\* OR low\* OR environment\*)) OR (low\* NEAR/3 (class\* OR educat\*)) OR (working NEAR/3 class\*) OR bilingual\* OR multilingual\* OR povert\* OR urban\* OR ((ethnic\* OR language\* OR linguist\*) NEAR/3 (divers\* OR factor\* OR minorit\*)) OR (english NEAR/3 ("second language")) OR ((home OR native OR first) PRE/1 (language) NEAR/3 "not English") OR migrant\* OR immigrant\* OR refugee\* OR (education\* PRE/1 (status OR level)) OR native OR depriv\* OR ((mother\* OR father\* OR parent\* OR maternal\* OR paternal\*) PRE/1 education\*) OR "single-parent\*" OR Socio-demograph\*)) AND (MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("children ") OR AB, TI(infan\* OR child\* OR toddler\* OR boy\* OR girl\* OR kindergar\* OR prepubescen\* OR prepubert\* OR schoolchild\* OR

preschool\*)) NOT AB, TI("health literacy" OR ((health OR ehealth OR emotion\* OR media OR nutrition\* OR food OR information\*) PRE/1 literac\*)) AND LA(English) AND (MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Experiments") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Intervention") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Efficiency") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Program Effectiveness") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Program Evaluation") OR MAINSUBJECT.EXACT.EXPLODE("Programs") OR AB, TI(experiment\* OR quasiexperiment\* OR intervention\* OR program\* OR efficac\* OR ((effect\* OR impact\*) NEAR/3 stud\*) OR effectivit\* OR effective\* OR effects OR evaluat\* OR trial\* OR random\*))

### Google Scholar

reading|literacy

parent|grandchildren|grandparents|mother|father|grandmothers|grandfathers|siblings

disadvantaged|"low income"|socioeconomic|"social class|status|environment"|ethnicity|minority

infants|children|toddlers|kindergarten|preschool

Database	Resultaten voor ontdubbeling	Resultaten na ontdubbeling
Web of science	3542	3538
PsycINFO	6526	5397
ERIC	2506	1645
Google Scholar	200	150
<b>Total</b>	<b>12774</b>	<b>10730</b>

## Bijlage 2 Interventie-, steekproef- en studiegenmerken van alle ingesloten studies

### Interventiegenmerken

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Naam	Type activiteit	Focus	Combi. centrum	Andere vaardigh.	Differentiatie	Tweetalig	Digitaal materiaal	Context	Aantal weken	Aantal sessies	Type trainer	Modeling	Oefening
1	Allen 2007	PCHP	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	M + T	Nee	Thuis	92	184	Prof	Ja	Nee
2	Anthony 2014	FN	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	36	5	Prof	Ja	Ja
3	Aram 2013	-	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Beide	7	8	Beide	?	Nee
4a	Aram 2014	-	FA	CD	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Beide	4	5	Beide	Ja	Ja
4b															
4c		EDR	VL	BG											
4d															
5a	Bekman 2004	MCEP	VL + FA	Beide	Nee	C + SE	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	25	25	Prof	Nee	Ja
5b															
6	Bierman 2015	REDI-P	VL + FA	Beide	Ja	SE	Nee	M	Nee	Thuis	?	16	Prof	Ja	Nee
7	Borisova 2017	ELMH	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	17	10	Prof	Nee	Ja
8	Boyce 2010	SHELLS	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Ja	M + T	Ja	Thuis	?	8	Beide	Nee	Ja
9	Brannon 2012	PARTNERS	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	M + T	Nee	School	10	15	Prof	Ja	Ja
10	Brown 2017	HIPPY	SR + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C + SE	Nee	M + T	Nee	Beide	?	?	Beide	Ja	Ja
11	Chacko 2018	FSSP	VL	BG	Nee	SE	Nee	M + T	Nee	School	8	8	Beide	Ja	Nee
12a	Chow 2003	DR	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	8	1	?	?	Nee
12b		TR								Geen training		0	Geen trainers	Nee	
13	Colmar 2014	-	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	?	Nee	Nee	?	17	1	Prof	Ja	Nee
14	Cooper 2014	DBS	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	T	Nee	School	7	7	Para	Nee	Ja
15	Cronan 1999	PRIMER	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	T	Nee	Thuis	30	18	Para	Ja	Ja

## Interventiekenmerken (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Naam	Type activiteit	Focus	Combi. centrum	Andere vaardigh.	Differentiatie	Tweetalig	Digitaal materiaal	Context	Aantal weken	Aantal sessies	Type trainer	Modeling	Oefening
16a	Cronan 1996	PRIMER	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	T	Nee	Thuis	30	18	Para	Ja	Ja
16b												3			
17a	Ergül 2016	ADR	VL + FA	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Beide	7	4	Prof	Ja	Ja
17b					Ja										
17c					Ja										
18a	Ford 2003	TP	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	6	6	?	Ja	Nee
18b															
19a	Ford 2009	LPiT	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	40	40	?	Ja	Nee
19b															
20	High 2000	-	VL	?	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	57	5	Prof	Nee	Nee
21	Hirst 2010	REAL	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	Nee	Ja	M + T	Nee	Beide	52	18	Prof	Ja	Ja
22	Ijalba 2015	-	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Ja	M + T	Nee	School	16	8	Prof	Ja	Ja
23	Johnson 1991	PCDC	VL + IA	BG	Nee	C	Ja	M + T	Nee	Beide	104	164	Para	Ja	Ja
24	Kagiticibasi 2001	TEEP (HIPPY)	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	SE	Nee	Nee	Nee	Beide	60	120	Para	Ja	Ja
25	Klieve 2015	PaL	VL + FA	?	Nee	Nee	Nee	T	Nee	Thuis	104	40	Para	Nee	Nee
26	Korat 2017	-	FA	CD	Nee	Nee	Nee	M + T	Ja	School	25	25	Prof	?	Ja
27a	Korat 2013	-	VL + FA	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Ja	Thuis	2	1	Prof	Ja	Nee
27b			VL						Nee						
28	Leung 2011	HOPE	VL + IA	BG	Nee	SE	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	30	30	Prof	Nee	Ja
29a	Lonigan 1998	DR	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	6	2	Prof	Ja	Ja
29b					Ja										
30	Manz 2016	PCHP	VL + IA	BG	Nee	SE	Nee	M + T	Nee	Thuis	46	92	Para	Ja	Nee

## Interventiekenmerken (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Naam	Type activiteit	Focus	Combi. centrum	Andere vaardigh.	Differentiatie	Tweetalig	Digitaal materiaal	Context	Aantal weken	Aantal sessies	Type trainer	Modeling	Oefening
31	Mendez 2010	TCC	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C + SE	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	39	9	Para	Ja	Ja
32	Murray 2016	DBS	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	T	Nee	School	8	8	Para	Ja	Ja
33	Necoechea 2007	HIPPY	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C + SE	Nee	M + T	Nee	Beide	15	15	Beide	Nee	Ja
34a	O'Farrelly 2018	PFL	VL + IA	BG	Nee	C + SE	Ja	Nee	Nee	Thuis	78	36	Prof	Ja	?
34b							Nee			Geen training		0	Geen trainers	Nee	Nee
35a	Reese 2010	DR	VL	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	22	6	Prof	Ja	Nee
35b		ER	IA				Ja								
36	Rochdi 2009	-	VL	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	6	1	Prof	Ja	Ja
37	Samiei 2016	IL	VL	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Thuis	261	0	Geen trainers	Nee	Nee
38	San Fancisco 2006	EASE	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	20	5	Para	Ja	Ja
39	Scott 2010	PALS	VL + FA	Beide	Nee	SE	Nee	Nee	Nee	Beide	18	18	Beide	?	Ja
40	St. Clair 2006	MEES	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Ja	C	Ja	Nee	Ja	School	43	25	Prof	Ja	Ja
41	St. Clair 2012	MEES	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Ja	C	Ja	Nee	Ja	School	43	25	Prof	Ja	Ja
42a	Thompson- Grubham 2014	PACT	VL + IA	Beide	Nee	SE	Ja	M	Nee	Thuis	352	?	Beide	Ja	Ja
42b															

## Interventiekenmerken (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Naam interventie	Type activiteit	Focus	Combi. centrum	Andere vaardigh.	Differentiatie	Tweetalig	Digitaal materiaal	Context	Aantal weken	Aantal sessies	Type trainer	Modeling	Oefening
43a	Van Tuijl 2001	OO (HIPPY)	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C + SE	Nee	M + T	Nee	Beide	60	54	Beide	Ja	Nee
43b															
44	Weber 2017	RPP	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	M + T	Nee	Beide	44	63	?	Ja	Ja
45	Weisleder 2018	UBB	VL + IA	BG	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	43	9	Prof	Ja	Ja
46a	Whitehurst 1994	DR	VL	BG	Ja	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	6	2	?	Ja	Ja
46b															
47	Williams 2000	-	VL	Beide	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	Nee	School	6	12	?	Nee	Ja
48	Zhang 2010	-	VL + IA + FA	Beide	Nee	C	Nee	M + T	Nee	School	8	8	Beide	Ja	Ja

Naam interventie: PCHP = Parent-Child Home Program, FN = Family Nights, EDR = Enriched Dialogic Reading, MCEd = Mother-Child Education Program, REDI-P = Research-Based Developmentally Informed Parent Program, ELMH = Emergent Literacy and Math at Home, SHELLS = Storytelling for the Home Enrichment of Language and Literacy Skills, PARNTERS = Parents As Reading Teachers Nightly Encouraging Reading Success, HIPPY = Home Instruction for Parents of Preschool Youngsters, FSSP = Fathers Supporting Success in Preschoolers, DR = Dialogic Reading, TR = Typical Reading, DBS = Dialogic Book Sharing, PRIMER = Producing Infant/Mother Ethnic Readers, ADR = Adapted Dialogic Reading, TP = Tandem Project, LPiT = Let's Play in Tandem, REAL = Raising Early Achievement in Literacy, PCDC = Parent-Child Development Center, TEEP = Turkish Early Enrichment Program, PaL = Parents and Learning, HOPE = Hands-On Parent Empowerment, TCC = The Companion Curriculum, PFL = Preparing for Life, ER = Elaborative Reminiscing, EASE = Early Access to Success in Education, IL = Imagination Library, PALS = Primary Age Learning Skills, MEES = Migrant Education Even Start, PACT = Parents and Children Together, OO = Opstap Opnieuw, RPP = Reinforcement of Parental Practices, UBB = Universidade do Bebê; Type activiteit: VL = Voorlezen, IA = andere Informele Activiteiten, FA = Formele Activiteiten; Focus: BG = Begripgerelateerde Vaardigheden, CD = Codegerelateerde Vaardigheden; Andere vaardigheden: C = andere Cognitieve vaardigheden, SE = Socialemotionele vaardigheden; Tweetalig: M = Materiaal, T = Training; Type trainers: Prof = Professionals, Para = Paraprofessionals.



## Steekproefkenmerken

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Meerderheid minderheden/migranten	Meerderheid tweedetaalleerders	Leeftijdsgroep	N experimenteel; N controle
1	Allen 2007	Ja	?	0-3 jaar	63/77;42/56
2	Anthony 2014	Ja	Nee	3-6 jaar	182-191;217-228
3	Aram 2013	?	Nee	3-6 jaar	28;28
4a	Aram 2014	?	?	3-6 jaar	37;27
4b					37;27
4c					35;27
4d					35;27
5a	Bekman 2004	?	Nee	3-6 jaar	102;115
5b					92;85
6	Bierman 2015	Nee	Nee	3-6 jaar	95;105
7	Borisova 2017	?	?	3-6 jaar	138;138
8	Boyce 2010	Ja	Ja	Mix	35;20
9	Brannon 2012	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	17;13
10	Brown 2017	?	Nee	3-6 jaar	10;12
11	Chacko 2018	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	64;62
12a	Chow 2003	?	?	3-6 jaar	27/29;27/28
12b					28/29;27/28
13	Colmar 2014	?	?	3-6 jaar	11;12
14	Cooper 2014	Ja	Ja	0-3 jaar	17;13
15	Cronan 1999	Ja	Nee	0-3 jaar	75-97;50-78
16a	Cronan 1996	Ja	Nee	0-3 jaar	83;69
16b					73;69
17a	Ergül 2016	?	Nee	3-6 jaar	17/18;16/18
17b					22/24;14/15
17c					13/14;14/20
18a	Ford 2003	?	?	Mix	30-33;21/33
18b					30-32; 21/33
19a	Ford 2009	Nee	Nee	3-6 jaar	30;30
19b					30;30
20	High 2000	Ja	Ja	Mix	75;75

## Steekproefkenmerken (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Meerderheid minderheden/migranten	Meerderheid tweedetaalleeders	Leeftijdsgroep	N experimenteel; N controle
21	Hirst 2010	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	8;8
22	Ijalba 2015	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	12;12
23	Johnson 1991	Ja	Ja	0-3 jaar	39;76
24	Kagiticibasi 2001	?	?	3-6 jaar	83;134
25	Klieve 2015	Ja	?	3-6 jaar	12;8
26	Korat 2017	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	134;100
27a	Korat 2013	?	Nee	3-6 jaar	30;30
27b					30;30
28	Leung 2011	Ja	?	3-6 jaar	65;54
29a	Lonigan 1998	Ja	Nee	Mix	16;27
29b					17;31
30	Manz 2016	Ja	Ja	0-3 jaar	46;37
31	Mendez 2010	Ja	?	3-6 jaar	177;111
32	Murray 2016	Ja	Ja	0-3 jaar	45;37
33	Necochea 2007	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	26;25
34a	O'Farrelly 2018	Nee	Nee	0-3 jaar	78;78
34b					80;78
35a	Reese 2010	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	7-9;7-11
35b			Nee		11/12;7-11
36	Rochdi 2009	Nee	Nee	3-6 jaar	30;15
37	Samiei 2016	Ja	Nee	Mix	143;120
38	San Francisco 2006	?	?	3-6 jaar	30;55
39	Scott 2010	Ja	?	3-6 jaar	88;86
40	St. Clair 2006	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	6/12;11/14
41	St. Clair 2012	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	13;20
42a	Thompson-Grubham 2014	Ja	?	Mix	48;432
42b					48;432
43a	Van Tuijl 2001	Ja	Ja	3-6 jaar	122;59
43b					83;55

### Steekproefkenmerken (vervolg)

Nr.	1e auteur jaar	Meerderheid minderheden/migranten	Meerderheid tweedetaalleeders	Leeftijdsgroep	N experimenteel; N controle
44	Weber 2017	Nee	Ja	Mix	105/220;105/220
45	Weisleder 2018	Nee	?	Mix	223;243
46a	Whitehurst 1994	Ja	Nee	3-6 jaar	19;26
46b					15/16;23
47	Williams 2000	Ja	?	0-3 jaar	16;16
48	Zhang 2010	Ja	Nee	3-6 jaar	41;38

## Studiekenmerken en kenmerken van de uitkomstmaat

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Peer-reviewed	Design	Gestandaardiseerd instrument	Type instrument	Tweetalig instrument	Meetmoment	Effectgrootte Overall;BG;CD
1	Allen 2007	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Follow-up	-0.36; -0.40; -0.33
2	Anthony 2014	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.14; 0.13; 0.21
3	Aram 2013	Ja	Experimenteel	Studie-specifiek	Observatie	Nee	Short-term	0.79; 0.79; -
4a	Aram 2014	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.52; 0.20; 0.86
4b							Follow-up	0.24; -0.14; 0.64
4c							Short-term	0.37; 0.41; 0.33
4d							Follow-up	0.43; 0.44; 0.41
5a	Bekman 2004	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Studie-specifiek	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.92; - ; -
5b							Follow-up	0.38; 0.38; -
6	Bierman 2015	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.11; 0.15; 0.09
7	Borisova 2017	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	-1.15; - ; -
8	Boyce 2010	Ja	Experimenteel	Studie-specifiek	Observatie	Ja	Short-term	0.58; 0.58; -
9	Brannon 2012	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	0.40; 0.40; -
10	Brown 2017	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	0.94; - ; -
11	Chacko 2018	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	0.37; 0.37; -
12a	Chow 2003	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.42; 0.28; 0.56
12b								0.17; 0.22; 0.13
13	Colmar 2014	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	1.29; 0.98; -

## Studiekenmerken en kenmerken van de uitkomstmaat (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Peer-reviewed	Design	Gestandaardiseerd instrument	Type instrument	Tweetalig instrument	Meetmoment	Effectgrootte Overall;BG;CD
14	Cooper 2014	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	0.84; 0.84; -
15	Cronan 1999	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Beide	Ja	Follow-up	-0.13; -0.13; -
16a	Cronan 1996	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Beide	Nee	Short-term	0.37; 0.37; -
16b								0.08; 0.08; -
17a	Ergül 2016	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.81; 0.65; 1.23
17b								-0.39; -0.57; -0.03
17c								0.18; 0.16; 0.23
18a	Ford 2003	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Studie-specifiek	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.18; - ; 0.18
18b							Follow-up	0.20; - ; 0.20
19a	Ford 2009	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Beide	Nee	Short-term	1.09; - ; 1.09
19b							Follow-up	0.67; 0.70; 0.64
20	High 2000	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Observatie	Nee	Short-term	2.91; 2.91; -
21	Hirst 2010	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	1.52; - ; -
22	Ijalba 2015	Ja	Experimenteel	Beide	Beide	Beide	Short-term	2.18; 2.18; -
23	Johnson 1991	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Follow-up	0.37; 0.37; 0.36
24	Kagiticibasi 2001	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Follow-up	0.30; 0.30; -
25	Klieve 2015	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Studie-specifiek	Observatie	Nee	Short-term	1.77; 1.93; 1.66
26	Korat 2017	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.68; - ; 0.68
27a	Korat 2013	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Studie-specifiek	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.75; 0.81; 0.73
27b								0.53; 0.72; 0.43
28	Leung 2011	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	-0.21; -0.21; -
29a	Lonigan 1998	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.22; 0.56; -
29b								0.56; 0.56; -
30	Manz 2016	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Ja	Short-term	0.63; 0.63; -
31	Mendez 2010	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test		Short-term	0.05; 0.14; -0.03
32	Murray 2016	Ja	Experimenteel	Bestaand	Observatie	Ja	Short-term	0.78; 0.78; -
33	Necochea 2007	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Beide	Short-term	0.09; 0.16; -0.04
34a	O'Farrelly 2018	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Observatie	Nee	Short-term	0.04; 0.04; -
34b								0.22; 0.22; -

### Studiekenmerken en kenmerken van de uitkomstmaat (vervolg)

Nr.	1 <sup>e</sup> auteur jaar	Peer-reviewed	Design	Gestandaardiseerd instrument	Type instrument	Tweetalig instrument	Meetmoment	Effectgrootte Overall;BG;CD
35a	Reese 2010	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Beide	Nee	Follow-up	-0.38; -0.38; -0.37
35b								0.09; 0.09; 0.10
36	Rochdi 2009	Nee	Experimenteel	Studie-specifiek	Test	Nee	Short-term	1.30; 3.61; 1.00
37	Samiei 2016	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.43; -; -
38	San Fancisco 2006	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	-0.06; 0.08; -0.10
39	Scott 2010	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Follow-up	-0.08; -; -0.08
40	St. Clair 2006	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Follow-up	0.42; -0.31; 1.03
41	St. Clair 2012	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Follow-up	0.70; 0.70; -
42a	Thompson-Grubham 2014	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Beide	Nee	Short-term	0.39; -; 0.39
42b							Follow-up	0.16; 0.28; -0.10
43a	Van Tuijl 2001	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Beide	Short-term	0.20; 0.20; -
43b								-0.01; -0.01; -
44	Weber 2017	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Observatie	Nee	Follow-up	0.07; -0.16; -
45	Weisleder 2018	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Bestaand	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.13; 0.13; -
46a	Whitehurst 1994	Ja	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Test	Nee	Short-term	0.14; 0.14; -
46b							Follow-up	0.13; 0.13; -
47	Williams 2000	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Studie-specifiek	Observatie	Nee	Short-term	0.48; -; 0.48
48	Zhang 2010	Nee	Quasi-exp.	Beide	Test	Beide	Short-term	0.34; 0.21; 0.66

## Bijlage 3 Moderatoranalyses

Moderator	Categorieën	Overall			Begripsgerelateerde vaardigheden			Codegerelateerde vaardigheden		
		<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q</i> , <i>p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q</i> , <i>p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q</i> , <i>p</i>
	Voorlezen									
Programmamenmerken	Voorlezen + formele act.	19	0.65 (0.14)		17	0.75 (0.18)		7	0.45 (0.13)	
	Voorlezen + informele	8	0.53 (0.20)		6	0.48 (0.27)	<i>Q</i> (4) = 15.25, <i>p</i> = .004	7	0.56 (0.21)	<i>Q</i> (4) = 5.02, <i>p</i> = .285
	Type activiteiten	9	0.45 (0.17)	<i>Q</i> (4) = 8.47, <i>p</i> = .076	6	0.46 (0.19)		1	0.39 (0.15)	
	Voorlezen + combinatie	10	0.19 (0.14)		8	0.13 (0.05)		5	0.33 (0.25)	
act.	2	0.64 (0.09)	1		0.20 (0.25)	2		0.70 (0.10)		
Formele activiteiten										
Programmafocust	Begripsgerelateerde v.	22	0.46 (0.09)		22	0.44 (0.09)		4	0.25 (0.08)	<i>Q</i> (2) = 12.94, <i>p</i> = .002
	Codegerelateerde v.	2	0.64 (0.09)	<i>Q</i> (2) = 5.23, <i>p</i> = .073	1	0.20 (0.25)	<i>Q</i> (2) = 1.17, <i>p</i> = .556	2	0.70 (0.10)	
	Beide vaardigheden	22	0.35 (0.10)		13	0.32 (0.12)		15	0.42 (0.12)	
Combinatie	Ja	6	0.11 (0.12)		6	0.10 (0.15)		3	0.08 (0.09)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 11.05, <i>p</i> = .001
centrumgericht	Nee	42	0.55 (0.08)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 9.55, <i>p</i> = .002	32	0.59 (0.10)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 7.13, <i>p</i> = .008	19	0.54 (0.10)	
Andere vaardigheden	Alleen geletterdheid	31	0.66 (0.10)			27		0.68 (0.13)		15
	Cognitieve vaardigheden	15	0.13 (0.36)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 11.13, <i>p</i> = .011	1	0.21 (0.11)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 17.99, <i>p</i> < .001	3	0.65 (0.28)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 14.49, <i>p</i> = .002
	Sociaal-emotionele v.	8	0.24 (0.12)		4	0.23 (0.15)		2	0.22 (0.15)	
	Beide vaardigheden	19	0.23 (0.10)		6	0.12 (0.04)		2	-0.03 (0.11)	
Differentiatie	Ja	5	0.90 (0.41)		<i>Q</i> (1) = 1.23, <i>p</i> = .267	3		0.93 (0.63)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 0.54, <i>p</i> = .463	
	Nee	42	0.44 (0.07)	34		0.46 (0.09)	21	0.48 (0.10)		
Tweetalig	Niet tweetalig	29	0.44 (0.10)		23	0.49 (0.12)		16	0.45 (0.11)	
	Materiaal tweetalig	2	0.22 (0.14)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 5.23, <i>p</i> = .156	1	0.15 (0.14)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 6.17, <i>p</i> = .103	2	0.22 (0.15)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 23.06, <i>p</i> < .001
	Training tweetalig	5	0.74 (0.24)		5	0.72 (0.22)		1	1.66 (0.26)	
Beide tweetalig	12	0.60 (0.15)	9		0.52 (0.19)	3		0.52 (0.17)		
Digitaal materiaal	Ja	3	0.68 (0.08)	<i>Q</i> (2) = 3.05, <i>p</i> = .081	2	0.64 (0.14)	<i>Q</i> (1) = .68, <i>p</i> = .409	2	0.69 (0.09)	<i>Q</i> (1) = 3.06, <i>p</i> = .080
	Nee	45	0.49 (0.08)		36	0.50 (0.09)		29	0.45 (0.10)	
Context	Thuis	14	0.57 (0.12)		11	0.68 (0.16)		9	0.66 (0.16)	
	School	18	0.54 (0.15)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 5.12, <i>p</i> = .163	14	0.63 (0.18)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 9.58, <i>p</i> = .022	5	0.39 (0.16)	<i>Q</i> (3) = 3.34, <i>p</i> = .343
	Combinatie	11	0.35 (0.12)		9	0.21 (0.12)		6	0.43 (0.21)	
	Geen training	3	0.29 (0.08)		2	0.22 (0.10)		1	0.13 (0.27)	

**(Vervolg)**

Moderator	Categorieën	Overall			Begripsgerelateerde vaardigheden			Codegerelateerde vaardigheden		
		<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> (SE)	<i>Q, p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> (SE)	<i>Q, p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> (SE)	<i>Q, p</i>
Type trainer	Professionals	21	0.65 (0.13)	$Q(3) = 5.39, p = .146$	18	0.67 (0.17)	$Q(3) = 7.74, p = .052$	10	0.44 (0.12)	$Q(3) = 1.46, p = 0.691$
	Paraprofessionals	8	0.40 (0.22)		7	0.61 (0.17)		2	0.76 (0.88)	
	Beide type trainers	11	0.35 (0.07)		9	0.30 (0.08)		5	0.46 (0.13)	
	Geen trainer	3	0.29 (0.08)		2	0.22 (0.10)		1	0.13 (0.27)	
Modeling	Ja	33	0.44 (0.07)	$Q(1) = 0.27, p = .604$	28	0.40 (0.08)	$Q(1) = 1.15, p = .283$	16	0.56 (0.41)	$Q(1) = 0.08, p = .772$
	Nee	12	0.59 (0.28)		8	0.83 (0.39)		4	0.44 (0.10)	
Begeleide oefening	Ja	30	0.69 (0.15)	$Q(1) = 2.69, p = .101$	23	0.41 (0.09)	$Q(1) = 1.88, p = .170$	14	0.41 (0.11)	$Q(1) = 0.78, p = .377$
	Nee	17	0.40 (0.08)		14	0.71 (0.20)		8	0.60 (0.18)	
Steekproefkenmerken Etnische/culturele achtergrond	Voorname-lijk	26	0.59 (0.11)	$Q(1) = 0.38, p = .539$	21	0.58 (0.13)	$Q(1) = 0.27, p = .602$	8	0.48 (0.15)	$Q(1) = 0.38, p = .540$
	minderheden	6	0.46 (0.17)		5	0.46 (0.19)		3	0.72 (0.36)	
	Voorname-lijk dominante gr.									
Taalachtergrond	Voorname-lijk	14	0.80 (0.19)	$Q(1) = 3.47, p = .062$	12	0.77 (0.23)	$Q(1) = 3.38, p = .066$	7	0.54 (0.20)	$Q(1) = 0.17, p = .929$
	anderstaligen	17	0.40 (0.09)		14	0.31 (0.10)		3	0.52 (0.17)	
	Voorname-lijk eerste- taalspr.									
Leeftijd	0-3 jaar	8	0.38 (0.11)	$Q(2) = 1.08, p = .584$	7	0.38 (0.11)	$Q(2) = 1.00, p = .606$	1	0.48 (0.36)	$Q(2) = 2.24, p = .327$
	3-6 jaar	32	0.48 (0.09)		26	0.46 (0.10)		2	0.28 (0.10)	
	mix	8	0.67 (0.29)		5	0.88 (0.54)		19	0.50 (0.11)	
Studiekenmerken Peer-reviewed	Ja	40	0.50 (0.08)	$Q(1) = 0.01, p = .923$	32	0.49 (0.09)	$Q(1) = 0.43, p = .511$	15	0.45 (0.12)	$Q(1) = 0.36, p = .551$
	Nee	8	0.49 (0.13)		6	0.69 (0.29)		7	0.55 (0.13)	
Onderzoeksdesign	Experimenteel	12	0.98 (0.22)	$Q(1) = 8.76, p = .003$	11	1.21 (0.28)	$Q(1) = 12.15, p < .001$	5	0.57 (0.17)	$Q(1) = 0.39, p = .530$
	Quasi-experimenteel	36	0.32 (0.06)		27	0.21 (0.05)		17	0.44 (0.12)	
Implementatiecheck	Ja	25	0.45 (0.11)	$Q(1) = 0.51, p = .477$	32	0.49 (0.09)	$Q(1) = 0.43, p = .511$	8	0.13 (0.07)	$Q(1) = 15.52, p < .001$
	Nee	23	0.55 (0.09)		6	0.69 (0.29)		14	0.66 (0.11)	



**(Vervolg)**

Moderator	Categorieën	Overall			Begripsgerelateerde vaardigheden			Codegerelateerde vaardigheden		
		<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q, p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q, p</i>	<i>k</i>	Cohen's <i>d</i> ( <i>SE</i> )	<i>Q, p</i>
Kenmerken										
effectmaat	Bestaand	30	0.37 (0.08)	$Q(2) = 8.61, p = .013$	30	0.34 (0.08)	$Q(2) = 9.90, p = .007$	9	0.21 (0.10)	$Q(1) = 8.48, p = .004$
Gestandaardiseerd	Studie-specifiek	10	0.84 (0.14)		6	1.29 (0.30)		13	0.68 (0.13)	
	Combinatie	8	0.51 (0.23)		2	1.16 (1.02)		0		
Type instrument	Test	37	0.36 (0.06)	$Q(2) = 4.00, p = .136$	28	0.28 (0.06)	$Q(2) = 5.42, p = .067$	20	0.42 (0.09)	$Q(1) = 1.25, p = .264$
	Observatie	7	0.97 (0.39)		6	1.06 (0.43)		2	1.09 (0.59)	
	Combinatie	4	0.84 (0.36)		4	0.84 (0.36)		0		
Tweetalig	Ja	8	0.63 (0.09)	$Q(2) = 2.02, p = .364$	6	0.54 (0.29)	$Q(2) = 0.62, p = .735$	1	-0.04 (0.28)	$Q(1) = 3.24, p = .072$
	Nee	35	0.46 (0.10)		27	0.49 (0.11)		21	0.50 (0.10)	
	Combinatie	5	0.54 (0.27)		5	0.60 (0.08)				